

Government of Pakistan **Directorate General of Trade Organizations** (Office of Regulator of Trade Organizations) Ministry of Commerce,



State Life Building No. 7, 2nd Floor, Blue Area,

F. No. 6(64)/2023-TO

Islamabad, the December 6th, 2023

ORDER IN ORIGINAL NO 34/2023

Passed by Mr. Umar Dad Afridi, Regulator of Trade Organizations

Ms. Humaira Bukhari nominee of Sahiwal Women Chamber of Commerce and Industry Versus

Election Commission of Federation of Pakistan Chamber of Commerce and Industry (FPCCI)

Present in the hearing.

1.	Ms. Humaira Bukhari	Appellant/Complainant
2.	Malik Ghulam Sabir, Advocate (on behalf of appellant)	
3.	Malik Sohail	
1.	Ms. Mahreen Razzak (on behalf of Secretary General FPCCI)	Respondents

(Member Election Commission of FPCCI) 3. Mr. Anjum Rasheed Bawa

(Member Election Commission of FPCCI) 4. Mr. Ali Nawaz Kharral, Advocate (on

behalf of Respondents)

5 Ms. Sadia Asif

6. Ms. Nabeela Farrukh

2. Mr. Arshad Khurshid

30-11-2023 Date of Hearing:

OFFICE OF REGULATOR OF TRADE ORGANIZATIONS, Place of Hearing: DIRECTORATE GENERAL OF TRADE ORGANIZATIONS,

STATE LIFE BUILDING NO.7, 2ND FLOOR, BLUE AREA,

ISLAMABAD.

Date of issuance of Order: 06-12-2023

Page 1 of 4

UMAR DAD AFRIDI **Regulator of Trade Organizations** Directorate General of Trade Organization Ministry of Commerce, Islamabad

By this Order the undersigned intends to dispose of an appeal filed by Ms. Humaira Bukhari, President, Women Chamber of Commerce and Industry, Sahiwal and Nasira Yawar, nominees of WCCI, Sahiwal against the decision dated 23-11-2023 of Election Commission of FFPCCI for exclusion of the names of the Appellants from, and inclusion of name of the respondents as nominees of WCCI, Sahiwal in, the provisional voters list of FPCCI for elections of the year 2024-2025. The matter was fixed for hearing on 01-12-2023 and was attended by the relevant parties.

- 2. Background of the case is that Secretary General, FPCCI and Election Commission, FPCCI vide decision No. 78, dated 23-11-2023, excluded the names of Ms. Humaira Bukhari President, WCCI, Sahiwal and Nasira Yawar, nominees of WCCI, Sahiwal from the provisional voters list and included the names of Ms. Nabeela Farrukh and Ms. Sadia Asif, in the provisional voters list.
- 3. The counsel of the appellants has submitted that the nominations of the appellants are valid and Election Commission of the FPCCI have not considered the documents submitted by the appellants and committed a material illegality while dismissing the appeal. The Appellants submitted that on 31-10-2023 the Appellants received a letter from the FPCCI regarding inclusion of the names of the Appellants as valid nominations as received from the WCCI, Sahiwal, but thereafter the Secretary General of FPCCI included the names of the Respondent No. 2 & 3 in the provisional voter list without any justification.
- 4. The counsel for appellants further stated that on 07-11-2023 the Secretary General of the WCCI Sahiwal filed a complaint before the Secretary General of the FPCCI for issuance of book of Membership Certificates to the Respondent No.1 & 2 which are no longer members of the SWCCI and requested to conduct a proper inquiry into the matter. However, no action till date has been taken by the Secretary General of the FPCCI. Through the titled Appeal the Appellants also requested for probing the matter and initiating legal proceeding against the responsible persons. The membership renewal certificates with the Respondent No. 1 & 2 have neither been issued and nor signed by the Appellants, that is the President and the Secretary General. That no fee has been deposited by the Respondents in the account of the WCCI, Sahiwal, for membership renewal, therefore, the said certificate are not valid.

UMAR DAD AFRIDI Page 2 of 4

Regulator of Trade Organizations
Directorate General of Trade Organization
Ministry of Commerce, Islamabad

- 5. The counsel for the Appellant further submitted that the Secretary General of the FPCCI and the Election commission of the FPCCI despite the fact that both the Respondents have not renewed their membership with the WCCI, Sahiwal, which is already established before the DGTO during the hearing on the complaint filed by Respondents and is reflected the Order in Original No. 22/2023 dated 10-10-2023, of the DGTO, made decisions against the law and facts of the case, and the decision of the Election Commission is liable to be set-aside.
- 6. The counsel of the respondent has submitted that the Appellants nominations were sent in violation of the Trade Organizations Rules and Trade Organizations Act, 2013, and the Executive Committee of the WCCI, Sahiwal is not completed without the presence of the Respondents. Therefore, the nominations of the Appellants are not valid as their nominations were never approved by the Executive Committee.

FINDINGS:-

The Appellants are valid member of the WCCI, Sahiwal and the Respondents have failed to submit any documentary proof to contradict the documents produced by the Appellants. They have also failed to provide any proof of deposit of renewal fee in the account of WCCI, Sahiwal. The certificates of the membership renewal produced by the Respondents have not been signed by the President and the Secretary General of the WCCI, Sahiwal. Issuance of the membership certificate book by the Secretary General of the FPCCI will be inquired separately. The Respondents have also failed to provide any evidence that would indicate that the Appellants are not eligible to be nominated for EC & GB seats for FPCCI election 2024-2025. Therefore, the instant appeal is liable to be accepted.



ORDERS:-

Arguments heard, record perused and relevant provisions of Law examined in light of the above the following orders passed:

- i) The instant Appeal is allowed and the decision of the Election Commission of the FPCCI is hereby set-aside.
- ii) The Secretary General of FPCCI is directed to include the names of the Appellants namely Ms. Humaira Bukhari, and Ms. Nasira Yawar as nominees of WCCI, Sahiwal, in the voter list of FPCCI for the year 2024-2025.
- iii) The matter stands disposed of accordingly.

(Umar Dad Afridi) Regulator (TO)

Announced Dated: 06-12-2023.

UMAR DAD AFRIDI
Regulator of Trade Organizations
Directorate General of Trade Organization
Ministry of Commerce, Islamabad